

Fuzzy Lattice-Theoretic Operations over Data and Knowledge Structures

Hassan Aït-Kaci and Gabriella Pasi

August 5, 2017

Abstract

This explores the lattice-theoretic properties of the fuzzy processing of data and knowledge structures, such as First-Order Terms (\mathcal{FOT} s) and Order-Sorted Feature (\mathcal{OSF}) graphs, when ordered with endomorphic structure subsumption. Understanding the formal operational aspects of (fuzzy) structure unification and its dual (fuzzy) structure generalization are invaluable pursuits. Sets of declarative rules and axioms characterizing these operations as constraint normalization also provide efficient operational interpretations. For example, fuzzy \mathcal{FOT} unification is used in Fuzzy Logic Programming (\mathcal{FLP}), thus adding fuzzy flexibility and expressivity to operations on \mathcal{FOT} s. This is true also for attributed instance and concept structures such as \mathcal{OSF} data and knowledge representation and processing. We overview the extant state of the art in fuzzy unification of \mathcal{FOT} s (there is no known work on fuzzy generalization), stressing formal algebraic and operational specificities of other approaches. Our method so-doing is to investigate how to explain, and complete the expressivity of, existing approaches by explicating their data-structure approximation algebras (structure-preserving subsumption, unification, and generalization). Our objective is to extend to fuzzy operations (to “fuzzify”) both lattice operations on \mathcal{FOT} s and \mathcal{OSF} graphs. Calibrating sets of equations with fuzzy truth levels as approximation structures then exploits a fuller set of lattice-theoretic operations (fuzzy unification, but also fuzzy generalization). Our pragmatic motivation is that such fuzzy lattice operations on sets of \mathcal{FOT} and \mathcal{OSF} equations are very convenient in structured data and knowledge representation and processing, such as Fuzzy Information Retrieval. Why Lattice Theory? Because it is the mathematics of consistent approximation: fuzzy unification of \mathcal{FOT} terms or \mathcal{OSF} graphs being the Greatest Lower Bound (GLB) operation, and fuzzy generalization of \mathcal{FOT} terms or \mathcal{OSF} graphs being the Least Upper Bound (LUB) operation. This provides a fuzzy GLB operation over \mathcal{FOT} s and \mathcal{OSF} object structures to act as, e.g., a kind of “fuzzy relational join” to specify approximate retrieval patterns over a relational database. Dually, the LUB operation is the computation of the most specific \mathcal{FOT} or \mathcal{OSF} graph up to a fuzzy threshold that is their most specific approximate generalization for that truth threshold. Such could be used, e.g., for fuzzy schema inference or Machine Learning by fuzzy inductive reasoning.

Keywords: Approximate Information Retrieval; Lattices; First-Order Terms; Fuzzy Unification; Fuzzy Generalization; Fuzzy Feature Structures; Structure-Based Induction; Pattern-Directed Reasoning; Fuzzy Pattern Abduction; Fuzzy Pattern Induction; Fuzzy Machine Learning.

Table of Contents	
1 Generalities	5
1.1 Motivation	5
1.2 Objective	6
1.3 Organization of contents	7
2 First-Order Terms	9
2.1 Subsumption Lattice	9
2.1.1 Unification rules	11
2.1.2 Generalization rules	13
2.2 Fuzzifying Subsumption	23
2.2.1 Fuzzy unification	23
2.2.2 Fuzzy generalization	34
3 Order-Sorted Feature Constraints	42
3.1 <i>OSF</i> Formalism	42
3.1.1 Informal background	43
3.1.2 Formal background	44
3.2 <i>OSF</i> Lattice Structure	50
3.3 Fuzzifying <i>OSF</i> Subsumption	51
3.3.1 Fuzzy <i>OSF</i> unification	53
3.3.2 Fuzzy <i>OSF</i> generalization	54
4 Related work	55
4.1 Feature Graph Similarity Measures	55
4.2 Potential ties	55
4.2.1 Fuzzy data models	55
4.2.2 Fuzzy knowledge	55
4.2.3 Fuzzy automata	56
4.2.4 Fuzzy Quantum Logic	56
4.3 Other links	56
4.3.1 Dynamic programming	57
4.3.2 Fuzzy FCA	57
4.3.3 Fuzzy GDL	57
5 Proposed Proofs of Concept	58
5.1 Structures and Operations	58
5.2 Applications	61
5.3 Use Case	61
6 Conclusion	62
6.1 Recapitulation	62
6.2 Further work	62
A Basic Lattice Theory	65
A.1 Essentials	65
A.2 Modularity, Distributivity	66
B Fuzziness of Fuzzification	68
C Relation Fuzzification	71
C.1 Crisp Relation	71
C.2 Fuzzy relation	72
C.3 Similarity	73
C.4 Fuzzy partial order	75
D Examples of <i>OSF</i> Lattice Operations	77
E Other Decidable <i>OSF</i> Constraints	87
F <i>FOT</i> Terms as <i>OSF</i> Terms	92
G Other Fuzzy Unification Work	97
H Fuzzy Implementations	103

List of Figures

2.1	<i>FOT</i> subsumption lattice operations	10
2.2	Herbrand-Martelli-Montanari <i>FOT</i> unification rules	12
2.3	Reynolds’s <i>FOT</i> “anti-unification” algorithm ([84], pages 138–139)	14
2.4	Plotkin’s <i>FOT</i> “least generalization” algorithm ([80], page 155)	14
2.5	Declarative axioms and rule for <i>FOT</i> generalization	16
2.6	Maria Sessa’s weak unification of <i>FOTs</i> as normalization rules	24
2.7	Generic fuzzification of <i>FOT</i> unification’s decomposition rule	30
2.8	Fuzzy generalization of <i>FOTs</i> with similar functors of equal arities	35
2.9	Fuzzy generalization of <i>FOTs</i> with similar functors of variant arities	39
3.1	Example of <i>OSF</i> graph	43
3.2	<i>OSF</i> term syntax for the <i>OSF</i> graph of Figure 3.1	44
3.3	Equivalent <i>OSF</i> term syntax for the <i>OSF</i> graph of Figure 3.1	45
3.4	Property inheritance as <i>OSF</i> endomorphism	46
3.5	Constraint normalization rules for <i>OSF</i> unification	49
3.6	Constraint normalization rules for <i>OSF</i> generalization [18]	50
3.7	<i>OSF</i> subsumption lattice operations	51
3.8	Constraint normalization rules for fuzzy <i>OSF</i> unification	53
A.1	Non-modular and non-distributive lattice diagrams	67
D.1	“School example” concept taxonomy	78
D.2	Example of <i>OSF</i> subsumption lattice operations	80
D.3	Tag-renaming normalization rules for <i>OSF</i> unification	82
E.1	Partial Features	87
E.2	Weak Extensionality	88
E.3	Strong extensionality	90
E.4	Aggregation	90

Bibliography

- [1] Ágnes Achs and Attila Kiss. Fuzzy extension of Datalog. *Acta Cybernetica*, 12(2):153–166, 1995. [Available [online](#)⁵].
- [2] Alfred Aho, John Hopcroft, and Jeffrey Ullmann. *The Design and Analysis of Computer Algorithms*. Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1974.
- [3] Hassan Aït-Kaci. *A Lattice-Theoretic Approach to Computation Based on a Calculus of Partially-Ordered Type Structures*. PhD thesis, Computer and Information Science, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, PA (USA), September 1984. Abstract: [Available [online](#)⁶].
- [4] Hassan Aït-Kaci. An algorithm for finding a minimal recursive path ordering. *Revue d’Automatique, d’Informatique, et de Recherche Opérationnelle—Informatique théorique*, 19(4):359–382, 1985. [Available [online](#)⁷].
- [5] Hassan Aït-Kaci. An algebraic semantics approach to the effective resolution of type equations. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 45:293–351, 1986. [Available [online](#)⁸].
- [6] Hassan Aït-Kaci. *Warren’s Abstract Machine—A Tutorial Reconstruction*. MIT Press, 1991. [Available [online](#)⁹].
- [7] Hassan Aït-Kaci. An introduction to LIFE—Programming with Logic, Inheritance, Functions, and Equations. In Dale Miller, editor, *Proceedings of the International Symposium on Logic Programming*, pages 52–68. MIT Press, October 1993. [Available [online](#)¹⁰].
- [8] Hassan Aït-Kaci. Data models as constraint systems—A key to the Semantic Web. *Constraint Processing Letters*, 1(1):33–88, November 2007. [Available [online](#)¹¹].
- [9] Hassan Aït-Kaci. $\mathcal{H}\mathcal{O}\mathcal{O}\mathcal{T}$ a language for expressing and querying *Hierarchical Ontologies, Objects, and Types*—a specification. Technical Report Number 16, *CEDAR* Project, LIRIS, Département d’Informatique, Université Claude Bernard Lyon 1, Villeurbanne, France, December 2014. [Available [online](#)¹²].
- [10] Hassan Aït-Kaci and Samir Amir. Classifying and querying very large taxonomies with bit-vector encoding. *Journal of Intelligent Information Systems*, 45(2):1–25, October 2015. [Available [online](#)¹³].
- [11] Hassan Aït-Kaci, Robert Boyer, Patrick Lincoln, and Roger Nasr. Efficient implementation of lattice operations. *ACM Transactions on Programming Languages and Systems*, 11(1):115–146, January 1989. [Available [online](#)¹⁴].

⁵http://people.inf.elte.hu/kiss/14abea/Achs_1995_ActaCybernetica.pdf

⁶<http://repository.upenn.edu/dissertations/AAI8505030/>

⁷<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/rairo85.pdf>

⁸<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/tcs-86.pdf>

⁹<http://wambook.sourceforge.net/>

¹⁰<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/ilps93.pdf>

¹¹<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/cpl-article.pdf>

¹²https://www.researchgate.net/publication/271714694_HOOT_A_Language_for_Expressing_and_Querying_Hierarchical_Ontologies_Objects_and_Types

¹³https://www.researchgate.net/publication/281375833_Classifying_and_Querying_Very_Large_Taxonomies_with_Bit_Vectors

¹⁴<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/encoding-toplas-89.pdf>

- [12] Hassan Ait-Kaci and Roberto di Cosmo. Compiling order-sorted feature term unification. Technical Note 7, Digital Paris Research Laboratory, Rueil-Malmaison, France, December 1993. [Available [online¹⁵](#)].
- [13] Hassan Ait-Kaci, Bruno Dumant, Richard Meyer, Andreas Podelski, and Peter Van Roy. The Wild LIFE handbook. [Available [online¹⁶](#)], 1994.
- [14] Hassan Ait-Kaci and Roger Nasr. Logic and inheritance. In *Proceedings of the 13th ACM Sigplan Conference on Principles of Programming Languages (POPL 1986)*, pages 219–228, St. Petersburg Beach, FL (USA), January 1986. Association for the Computing Machinery, ACM. [Available [online¹⁷](#)].
- [15] Hassan Ait-Kaci and Andreas Podelski. Towards a meaning of LIFE. *Journal of Logic Programming*, 16(3-4):195–234, 1993. [Available [online¹⁸](#)].
- [16] Hassan Ait-Kaci, Andreas Podelski, and Seth C. Goldstein. Order-sorted feature theory unification. *Journal of Logic Programming*, 30(2):99–124, 1997. [Available [online¹⁹](#)].
- [17] Hassan Ait-Kaci, Andreas Podelski, and Gert Smolka. A feature-based constraint system for logic programming with entailment. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 122(1–2):263–283, January 1994. [Available [online²⁰](#)].
- [18] Hassan Ait-Kaci and Yutaka Sasaki. An axiomatic approach to feature term generalization. In Luc de Raedt and Peter Flach, editors, *Proceedings of the 12th European Conference on Machine Learning (ECML'01)*, pages 1–12, Berlin Heidelberg, September 2001. LNCS 2167, Springer-Verlag. [Available [online²¹](#)].
- [19] Srinivas M. Aji. *Graphical Models and Iterative Decoding*. PhD thesis, California Institute of Technology, Pasadena, CA, USA, May 2000. [Available [online²²](#)].
- [20] Srinivas M. Aji and Robert J. McEliece. The generalized distributive law. *IEEE Transactions on Information Theory*, 46(2):325–343, March 2000. [Available [online²³](#)].
- [21] Teresa Alsinet, Llús Godo, and Sandra Sandri. Two formalisms of extended possibilistic logic programming with context-dependent fuzzy unification: a comparative description. *Electronic Notes in Theoretical Computer Science*, 66(5):21 pages, 2002. [Available [online²⁴](#)].
- [22] Francesca Arcelli and Ferrante Formato. A fuzzy logic programming language. pages 319–332, 1997. [Available [online²⁵](#)].
- [23] Francesca Arcelli and Ferrante Formato. Likelog: A logic programming language for flexible data retrieval. In Hisham Al Haddad, editor, *Proceedings of the 1999 ACM Symposium on Applied Computing*, pages 260–267, San Antonio, TX (USA), February 28–March 2, 1999. Association for Computing Machinery, ACM. [Available [online²⁶](#)].

¹⁵<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/PRL-TN-7.pdf>

¹⁶<http://citeseer.ist.psu.edu/134450.html>

¹⁷<http://www.hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/login-popl-86.pdf>

¹⁸<http://hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/meaningoflife.pdf>

¹⁹<http://www.hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/osf-theory-unification.pdf>

²⁰<http://www.hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/tcs-94.pdf>

²¹<http://www.hassan-ait-kaci.net/pdf/ecml01.pdf>

²²<http://thesis.library.caltech.edu/1340/>

²³<http://authors.library.caltech.edu/1541/1/AJieetit00.pdf>

²⁴<http://repositori.udl.cat/bitstream/handle/10459.1/57984/001858.pdf>

²⁵<http://www.programmazione logica.it/wp-content/uploads/1997/06/319Fontana1.pdf>

²⁶<http://doi.acm.org/10.1145/298151.298348>

- [24] Francesca Arcelli, Ferrante Formato, and Giangiacomo Gerla. Unification through similarity relations. *Bulletin pour les Sous Ensembles Flous et leurs Applications (BUSEFAL)*, pages 3–12, 1997. [Available [online](#)²⁷].
- [25] Francesca Arcelli-Fontana. Likelog for flexible query answering. *Soft Computing*, 7(2):107–114, December 2002. [Available [online](#)²⁸].
- [26] Francesca Arcelli-Fontana and Ferrante Formato. A similarity-based resolution rule. *International Journal of Intelligent Systems*, 17:853–872, 2002. [Available [online](#)²⁹].
- [27] Peter R.J. Asveld. Algebraic aspects of families of fuzzy languages. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 293(2):417–445, February 2003. [Available [online](#)³⁰].
- [28] Franz Baader and Ulrike Sattler. Description logics with aggregates and concrete domains. In *Proceedings of the International Workshop on Description Logics*, Gif sur Yvette, France, 1997. [Available [online](#)³¹].
- [29] Rolf Backofen. Regular path expressions in feature logic. In Claude Kirchner, editor, *Proceedings of the 5th International Conference on Rewriting Techniques and Applications (RTA'93)*, pages 121–135, Montreal, QC (Canada), June 16–8, 1993. Springer. LNCS 690, [Available [online](#)³²].
- [30] James F. Baldwin, Jonathan Lawry, and Trevor P. Martin. Efficient algorithms for semantic unification. In *Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Information Processing and Management of Uncertainty in Knowledge-Based Systems (IPMU '96)*, pages 527–532, Granada, Spain, July 1–5, 1996. [Available [online](#)³³].
- [31] James F. Baldwin and B. W. Pilsworth. Semantic unification with fuzzy concepts in FRIL. *International Journal of Intelligent Systems*, 7(1):61–69, January 1992. [Available [online](#)³⁴].
- [32] Richard Bellman. The theory of dynamic programming. *Bulletin of the American Mathematical Society*, 60(6):503–515, September 2, 1954. Invited address at the annual summer meeting of the AMS, Laramie, WY (USA) [Available [online](#)³⁵].
- [33] Garrett Birkhoff. *Lattice Theory*, volume 25 of *Colloquium Publications*. American Mathematical Society, Providence, RI (USA), 1940, revised 1948, 1967, 1979, and 1979. [Available [online](#)³⁶].
- [34] Garrett Birkhoff and Jonh Non Neumann. The logic of quantum mechanics. *Annals of Mathematics*, 37(4):823–843, October 1936. [Available [online](#)³⁷].
- [35] Gloria Bordogna, Dario Lucarella, and Gabriella Pasi. A fuzzy object oriented data model. In *Proceedings of the 3rd IEEE Conference on Fuzzy Systems*. IEEE World Congress on Computational Intelligence, July 1994. [Available [online](#)³⁸].
- [36] Tru H. Cao and Peter N. Creasy. Fuzzy types: a framework for handling uncertainty about types of objects. *International Journal of Approximate Reasoning*, 25(3):217–253, November 2000. [Available [online](#)³⁹].

²⁷<http://www.dmi.unisa.it/people/gerla/www/Down/unification.pdf>

²⁸

²⁹<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/0995/f2c03c9f6f19606777dafad313e3be0fa34a.pdf>

³⁰<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304397501003541>

³¹<http://citeseer.ist.psu.edu/article/baader98description.html>

³²<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0747717184710285>

³³<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/summary?doi=10.1.1.196.2811>

³⁴<http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1002/int.4550070108/abstract>

³⁵<https://www.rand.org/content/dam/rand/pubs/papers/2008/P550.pdf>

³⁶<http://documents.mx/documents/lattice-theory-3ed-1967-birkhoffpdf.html>

³⁷<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/cff7/f5f6d0c04c9932def89be65bb5abc6cb7403.pdf>

³⁸https://www.researchgate.net/publication/3575027_A_fuzzy_object_oriented_data_model

³⁹<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0888613X00000554>

- [37] Tru Hoang Cao and Jonathan Michael Rossiter. FRIL++ for machine learning. 2002. [Available [online⁴⁰](#)].
- [38] Yongzhi Cao and Yoshinori Ezawac. Nondeterministic fuzzy automata. *Information Sciences*, 191:86–97, 2012. [Available [online⁴¹](#)].
- [39] Bob Carpenter. Typed feature structures: A generalization of first-order terms. In Vijay Saraswat and Kazunori Ueda, editors, *Proceedings of the 1991 International Symposium on Logic Programming*, pages 187–201, Cambridge, MA, 1991. MIT Press.
- [40] Stefano Ceri, Georg Gottlob, and Letizia Tanca. What you always wanted to know about datalog (and never dared to ask). *IEEE Transactions on Knowledge and Data Engineering*, 1(1):146–166, March 1989. [Available [online⁴²](#)].
- [41] Aarathi Chandramohan and M. V. C. Rao. Novel, useful, and effective definitions for fuzzy linguistic hedges. *Discrete Dynamics in Nature and Society*, 2006(Article ID 46546):1–13, 2006. [Available [online⁴³](#)].
- [42] William F. Clocksin and Christopher S. Mellish. *Programming in Prolog*. Springer-Verlag, 2nd edition, 1984.
- [43] Erik D. Demaine, Shay Mozes, Benjamin Rossman, and Oren Weimann. An optimal decomposition algorithm for tree edit distance. *ACM Transactions on Algorithms*, 6(1):article 2, December 2009. [Available [online⁴⁴](#)].
- [44] Didier Dubois and Henri Prade. *Fuzzy Sets and Systems: Theory and Applications*, volume 144 of *Mathematics in Science and Engineering*, Edited by William F. Ames, Georgia Institute of Technology. Academic Press, 180. [Available [online⁴⁵](#)].
- [45] Leonidas Fegaras. Query unnesting in object-oriented databases. In *Proceedings of the 1998 ACM SIGMOD International Conference on Management of Data*, pages 49–60, Seattle, WA (USA), June 2–4 1998. [Available [online⁴⁶](#)].
- [46] Leonidas Fegaras and David Maier. Optimizing object queries using an effective calculus. *ACM Transactions on Database Systems*, 25(4):457–516, December 2000. [Available [online⁴⁷](#)].
- [47] David Gilbert and Michael Schroeder. FURY: Fuzzy unification and resolution based on edit distance. In Nikolaos G. Bourbakis, editor, *Proceedings of the 1st IEEE International Symposium on Bioinformatics and Biomedical Engineering (BIBE 2000)*, pages 330–336, Arlington, VA (USA), November 8–10, 2000. IEEE Computer Society. [Available [online⁴⁸](#)].
- [48] Joseph A. Goguen. L-fuzzy sets. *Journal of Mathematical Analysis and Applications*, 18:145–174, 1967. [Available [online⁴⁹](#)].
- [49] Lovre Grisogono. Classical logic vs. quantum logic. Lecture slides, University of Zagreb, Croatia, July 8–9 2013. [Available [online⁵⁰](#)].

⁴⁰<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/summary?doi=10.1.1.8.4851>

⁴¹<http://arxiv.org/pdf/1012.2162.pdf>

⁴²<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/summary?doi=10.1.1.210.1118>

⁴³<https://www.hindawi.com/journals/ddns/2006/046546>

⁴⁴<http://www.cs.haifa.ac.il/~oren/Publications/TEDinTALG.pdf>

⁴⁵<ftp://ftp.micronet-rostov.ru/linux-support/books/computer%20science/Fuzzy%20systems/Fuzzy%20Sets%20And%20>

⁴⁶<http://lambda.uta.edu/sigmod98.ps.gz>

⁴⁷<http://lambda.uta.edu/tods00.ps.gz>

⁴⁸<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/ce6c/380e804ac52124fbf72dcf57338aa660c307.pdf>

⁴⁹<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/0022247X67901898>

⁵⁰http://mapmf.pmfst.unist.hr/~sokolic/lib/exe/fetch.php?media=prezentacija_split_phy_phi.pdf

- [50] Torsten Grust. A versatile representation for queries. In P.M.D. Gray, L. Kerschberg, P.J.H. King, and A. Poulouvasilis, editors, *The Functional Approach to Data Management: Modeling, Analyzing and Integrating Heterogeneous Data*. Springer, September 2003. [Available [online](#)⁵¹].
- [51] Hyowon Gweon, Joshua B. Tenenbaum, and Laura E. Schulz. Infants consider both the sample and the sampling process in inductive generalization. In Susan E. Carey, editor, *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, pages 9066–9071, Harvard University, Cambridge, MA (USA), May 18, 2010. PNAS vol. 107, no. 20, National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America. [Available [online](#)⁵²].
- [52] Jacques Herbrand. *Recherches sur la théorie de la démonstration*. PhD thesis, Faculté des sciences de l’université de Paris, Paris (France), 1930. [Available [online](#)⁵³]; English translation in [53].
- [53] Jacques Herbrand. *Logical Writings*. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA, 1971. Edited by Warren D. Goldfarb.
- [54] Markus Höhfeld and Gert Smolka. Definite relations over constraint languages. LILOG Report 53, IWBS, IBM Deutschland, Stuttgart, Germany, October 1988. [Available [online](#)⁵⁴].
- [55] Gérard Huet. Résolution d’équations dans des langages d’ordre $1, 2, \dots, \omega$. Thèse d’état, Université de Paris VII, Paris (France), 1976.
- [56] Jelena Ignjatović and Miroslav Ćirić. Myhill-nerode theory for fuzzy languages and automata. Lecture Slides, AUTOMATHA Workshop on Algebraic Theory of Automata and Logic, Szeged, Hungary⁵⁵, September 30–October 1 2006. [Available [online](#)⁵⁶].
- [57] Joxan Jaffar. Efficient unification over infinite terms. *New Generation Computing*, 2(3):207 – 219, September 1984. [Available [online](#)⁵⁷].
- [58] Joxan Jaffar and Jean-Louis Lassez. Constraint logic programming. In *Proceedings of the 14th ACM Symposium on Principles of Programming Languages*, Munich, W. Germany, January 1987.
- [59] Petteri Jokinen, Jorma Tarhio, and Esko Ukkonen. A comparison of approximate string matching algorithms. *Software–Practice and Experience*, 1(1988):1–4, January 1. [Available [online](#)⁵⁸].
- [60] Pascual Julián-Iranzo. A procedure for the construction of a similarity relation. In Luis Magdalena, Manuel Ojeda-Aciego, and José-Luis Verdegay, editors, *Proceedings of the 12th International Conference on Information Processing and Management of Uncertainty in Knowledge-Based Systems (IPMU ’08)*, pages 489–496, Málaga, Spain, June 22–27, 2008. [Available [online](#)⁵⁹].
- [61] Pascual Julián-Iranzo, Ginés Moreno, Jaime Penabad, and Carlos Vázquez. A fuzzy logic programming environment for managing similarity and truth degrees. In Santiago Escobar, editor, *Proceedings XIV Jornadas sobre Programación y Lenguajes (PROLE 2014)*, pages 71–86. Electronic Proceedings in Theoretical Computer Science, EPTCS 173, January 2015. [Available [online](#)⁶⁰].
- [62] Pascual Julián-Iranzo and Clemente Rubio-Manzano. A similarity-based WAM for Bousi~Prolog. In *Proceedings of the 10th International Work-Conference on Artificial Neural Networks (IWANN ’09)—Part I: Bio-Inspired Systems: Computational and Ambient Intelligence*, pages 245–252, Salamanca, Spain, June 10–12, 2009. Springer. [Available [online](#)⁶¹].

⁵¹<http://www.fmi.uni-konstanz.de/~grust/files/monad-comprehensions.pdf>

⁵²<http://www.pnas.org/content/107/20/9066.full.pdf>

⁵³http://archive.numdam.org/article/THESE_1930_110_1_0.pdf

⁵⁴<http://citeseer.ist.psu.edu/hohfeld88definite.html>

⁵⁵<http://www.inf.u-szeged.hu/~cs106/ws.php>

⁵⁶<http://www.inf.u-szeged.hu/~cs106/Content/pdfs/sunday/1150-Miroslav-Ciric/myhill.pdf>

⁵⁷<https://link.springer.com/article/10.1007/BF03037057>

⁵⁸<https://www.cs.hut.fi/~tarhio/papers/jtu.pdf>

⁵⁹<http://www.gimac.uma.es/ipmu08/proceedings/papers/065-Julian.pdf>

⁶⁰<https://arxiv.org/pdf/1501.02034.pdf>

⁶¹https://www.researchgate.net/publication/221582279_A_Similarity-Based_WAM_for_BousiProlog

- [63] Pascual Julián-Iranzo and Clemente Rubio-Manzano. An efficient fuzzy unification method and its implementation into the Bousi~Prolog system. In *Proceedings of 19th IEEE International Conference on Fuzzy Systems (FUZZ-IEEE 2010)*, pages 658–665, Barcelona, Spain, July 18–23, 2010. IEEE. [Available [online](#)⁶²].
- [64] Pascual Julián-Iranzo, Clemente Rubio-Manzano, and Juan Gallardo-Casero. Bousi~Prolog: a Prolog extension language for flexible query answering. *Electronic Notes in Theoretical Computer Science*, 248:131–147, August 5, 2009. [Available [online](#)⁶³].
- [65] Kevin Knight. Unification: a multidisciplinary survey. *ACM Computing Surveys*, 21(1):93–124, March 1989. [Available [online](#)⁶⁴].
- [66] Robert A. Kowalski. *Logic for Problem Solving*, volume 7 of *Artificial Intelligence Series*. North Holland, New York, NY, 1979.
- [67] Simon Lacoste-Julien, Konstantina Palla, Alex Davies, Gjergji Kasneci, Thore Graepel, and Zoubin Ghahramani. SiGMa: Simple greedy matching for aligning large knowledge bases. In Inderjit S. Dhillon, Yehuda Koren, Rayid Ghani, Ted E. Senator, Paul Bradley, Rajesh Parekh, Jingrui He, Robert L. Grossman, and Ramasamy Uthrusamy, editors, *Proceedings of the 19th ACM International Conference on Knowledge Discovery and Data Mining (SIGKDD 2013—Chicago, IL, USA)*, pages 572–580, New York, NY (USA), August 11–14, 2013. Association for Computing Machinery, ACM. [Available [online](#)⁶⁵]; see also [Available [online](#)⁶⁶].
- [68] Vladimir I. Levenshtein. Binary codes capable of correcting deletions, insertions, and reversals. *Soviet Physics—Doklady, Cybernetics and Control Theory*, 10(8):707–710, February 1966. [Available [online](#)⁶⁷].
- [69] Ravi K. M. *Some Investigations in Fuzzy Automata*. PhD thesis, Jaypee Institute of Information Technology, Noida (India), February 2012. [Available [online](#)⁶⁸].
- [70] Ebrahim E. Mamdani. Application of fuzzy logic to approximate reasoning using linguistic synthesis. *IEEE Transactions on Computers*, C-26(12):1182–1191, December 1977. [Available [online](#)⁶⁹].
- [71] Ebrahim E. Mamdani and Seto Assilian. An experiment in linguistic synthesis with a fuzzy logic controller. *International Journal of Man-Machine Studies*, 7(1):1–13, January 1975. [Available [online](#)⁷⁰].
- [72] Alberto Martelli and Ugo Montanari. An efficient unification algorithm. *ACM Transactions on Programming Languages and Systems*, 4(2):258–282, April 1982. [Available [online](#)⁷¹].
- [73] Takashi Mitsuishi and Grzegorz Bancerek. Lattice of fuzzy sets. *Formalized Mathematics*, 11(4):393–398, 2003. [Available [online](#)⁷²].
- [74] Jiří Močkoř. Fuzzy and non-deterministic automata. Research Report 8, University of Ostrava, Institute for Research and Applications of Fuzzy Modeling, Ostrava (Czech Republic), November 6, 1997. [Available [online](#)⁷³].

⁶²<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/f084/ae4f51a755c2748ae964b036976a68a18c58.pdf>

⁶³<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1571066109002874>

⁶⁴<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download;jsessionid=92AF7CA745E2C0B8EB619F09FFB5D3CA?doi=10.1.1.64.8>

⁶⁵<http://snap.stanford.edu/social2012/papers/lacostejulien-palla-etal.pdf>

⁶⁶<https://arxiv.org/pdf/1207.4525.pdf>

⁶⁷<https://nymity.ch/sybilhunting/pdf/Levenshtein1966a.pdf>

⁶⁸<http://www.jiit.ac.in/uploads/Synopsis%20Ravi.pdf>

⁶⁹<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/5f51/e8e90ee966a787ad5ee56506769f8d11d81d.pdf>

⁷⁰<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0020737375800022>

⁷¹<http://moscova.inria.fr/~levy/courses/X/IF/03/pi/levy2/martelli-montanari.pdf>

⁷²http://mizar.uwb.edu.pl/fm/2003-11/pdf11-4/lfuzzy_0.pdf

⁷³http://irafm.osu.cz/research_report/8_rep08.pdf

- [75] Jiří Močkoř. Fuzzy and non-deterministic automata. *Soft Computing*, 3(4):221–226, December 1999. See also [74].
- [76] Santiago Onta nón and Enric Plaza. Similarity measures over refinement graphs. *Machine Learning*, 87(1):57–92, 2012. [Available [online](#)⁷⁴].
- [77] Robert A. Orchard. *FuzzyCLIPS Users Guide*. Integrated Reasoning Group, Institute for Information Technology, National Research Council, Ottawa, ON (Canada), version 6.10d edition, October 2004. [Available [online](#)⁷⁵].
- [78] Juiyao Pan, Guilherme N. DeSouza, and Avinash C. Kak. A large-scale expert system shell using fuzzy logic for uncertainty reasoning. *IEEE Transactions on Fuzzy Systems*, 6(4):563–581, November 1998. [Available [online](#)⁷⁶].
- [79] Gordon D. Plotkin. Lattice theoretic properties of subsumption. Technical Memo MIP-R-77, Department of Machine Intelligence and Perception, University of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, Scotland (UK), June 1970.
- [80] Gordon D. Plotkin. A note on inductive generalization. In Bernard Metzer and Donald Michie, editors, *Machine Intelligence 5*, chapter 8, pages 154–163. Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, Scotland (UK), 1970. [Available [online](#)⁷⁷].
- [81] Gordon D. Plotkin. A further note on inductive generalization. In Bernard Metzer and Donald Michie, editors, *Machine Intelligence 6*, chapter 8, pages 101–124. Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, Scotland (UK), 1971. [Available [online](#)⁷⁸].
- [82] Jarosław Pykacz. Fuzzy quantum logic i. *International Journal of Theoretical Physics*, 32(10):1691–1708, October 1993.
- [83] Jarosław Pykacz. Quantum structures and fuzzy set theory. In Kurt Engesser, Dov M. Gabbay, and Daniel Lehmann, editors, *Handbook of Quantum Logic and Quantum Structures—Quantum Structures*, pages 55–74. Elsevier, 2007. [Available [online](#)⁷⁹].
- [84] John C. Reynolds. Transformational systems and the algebraic nature of atomic formulas. In Bernard Metzer and Donald Michie, editors, *Machine Intelligence 5*, chapter 7, pages 135–151. Edinburgh University Press, Edinburgh, Scotland (UK), 1970. [Available [online](#)⁸⁰].
- [85] John A. Robinson. A machine-oriented logic based on the resolution principle. *Journal of the ACM*, 12:23–41, January 1965. [Available [online](#)⁸¹].
- [86] Jonathan M. Rossiter, T.H. Cao, T. P. Martin, and James F. Baldwin. A FRIL++ compiler for soft computing object-oriented logic programming. In *Proceedings of the 6th International Conference on Soft Computing*, pages 340–345, Iizuka, Fukuoka, Japan, October 1–4, 2000. [Available [online](#)⁸²].
- [87] Yutaka Sasaki. Applying type oriented ILP to IE rule generation. In *Proceedings of the Workshop on Machine Learning for Information Extraction*, pages 43–47, Orlando, FL (USA), 1999. AAAI-99. [Available [online](#)⁸³].

⁷⁴<https://link.springer.com/content/pdf/10.1007%2Fs10994-011-5274-3.pdf>

⁷⁵<http://mma.perso.eisti.fr/HTML-SE/Programme/fzdocs.pdf>

⁷⁶<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/ed63/831d2e69abda3673983fdb3f0427726dd63.pdf>

⁷⁷http://homepages.inf.ed.ac.uk/gdp/publications/MI5_note_ind.gen.pdf

⁷⁸http://homepages.inf.ed.ac.uk/gdp/publications/MI6_further_note.pdf

⁷⁹<http://cachescan.bcub.ro/e-book/E1/580520/55-74.pdf>

⁸⁰<http://www.cs.cmu.edu/afs/cs/user/jcr/ftp/transysalg.pdf>

⁸¹<https://www.academia.edu/3240410/A-Machine-Oriented-Logic-Based-on-the-Resolution-Principle>

⁸²<http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/summary?doi=10.1.1.33.3537>

⁸³<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/ec8e/e66e6a1125b48a580d01ce0d7719eca180f6.pdf>

- [88] Yutaka Sasaki. Induction logic based on ψ -terms. In *Proceedings of the 10th International Conference on Algorithmic Learning Theory*, pages 169–181, Tokyo, Japan, 1999. ALT-99, Springer-Verlag LNAI 1720.
- [89] Yutaka Sasaki. *Hierarchically Sorted Inductive Logic Programming and its Application to Information Extraction*. PhD thesis, Graduate School of Systems and Information Engineering, University of Tsukuba, Japan, September 2000.
- [90] Yutaka Sasaki and Masahiko Haruno. RHB⁺: A type oriented ILP system learning from positive data. In *Proceedings of IJCAI-97*, pages 894–899, Nagoya, Japan, 1997. [Available [online](#)⁸⁴].
- [91] Manfred Schmidt-Schauß and Gert Smolka. Attributive concept descriptions with complements. *Artificial Intelligence*, 48:1–26, 1991.
- [92] Michael Schroeder and Ralf Schweimeier. Arguments and misunderstandings: Fuzzy unification for negotiating agents. *Electronic Notes in Theoretical Computer Science*, 70(5):1–19, October 2002. [Available [online](#)⁸⁵].
- [93] Ralf Schweimeier and Michael Schroeder. Fuzzy unification and argumentation for well-founded semantics. In Peter Van Emde Boas and Július Štuller Jaroslav Pokorný, Mária Bieliková, editors, *Proceedings of the 30th Conference on Current Trends in Theory and Practice of Computer Science*, pages 102–121, Měříň, Czech Republic, 24–30 January 2004. LNCS 2932, Springer, Lecture Notes in Computer Science. [Available [online](#)⁸⁶].
- [94] Maria I. Sessa. Approximate reasoning by similarity-based SLD resolution. *Theoretical Computer Science*, 275:389–426, 2002. [Available [online](#)⁸⁷].
- [95] Umberto Straccia. A fuzzy description logic. In Jack Mostow and Chuck Rich, editors, *Proceedings of the 15th National Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, Madison, WI (USA), 1998. American Association for Artificial Intelligence. [Available [online](#)⁸⁸].
- [96] Umberto Straccia. Reasoning within fuzzy description logics. *Journal of Artificial Intelligence Research*, 14:137–166, 2001. [Available [online](#)⁸⁹].
- [97] S.P. Tiwari, Anupam K. Singh, and Shambhu Sharan. Fuzzy subsystems of fuzzy automata based on lattice-ordered monoid. *Annals of Fuzzy Mathematics and Informatics*, 7(3):437–445, March 2013. [Available [online](#)⁹⁰].
- [98] S.P. Tiwari, Vijay K. Yadav, and Anupam K. Singh. On algebraic study of fuzzy automata. *International Journal of Machine Learning and Cybernetics*, 6(3):479–485, June 2015.
- [99] Jean van Heijenoort. *From Frege to Gdel—A Source Book in Mathematical Logic, 1879–1931*. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA (USA), 1967.
- [100] Claudio Vaucheret, Sergio Guadarrama, and Susana Mu noz Hernández. Fuzzy Prolog: a simple general implementation using CLP(\mathcal{R}). In Matthias Baaz and Andrei Voronkov, editors, *Proceedings of the 9th International Conference on Logic for Programming Artificial Intelligence and Reasoning (LPAR 2002)*, pages 450–464, Tbilisi, Georgia, October 14–18, 2002. LNCS 2514, Springer. [Available [online](#)⁹¹].

⁸⁴https://www.researchgate.net/publication/220814962.RHB_A_type-oriented_ILP_system_learning_from_positive_data

⁸⁵<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S1571066104805851>

⁸⁶<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/a623/f8302765ee433fae2f0291a6383f8a1818c5.pdf>

⁸⁷<http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/article/pii/S0304397501001888>

⁸⁸<http://www.aaai.org/Papers/AAAI/1998/AAAI98-084.pdf>

⁸⁹<https://www.jair.org/media/813/live-813-1948-jair.pdf>

⁹⁰[http://www.afmi.or.kr/papers/2014/Vol-07_No-03/AFMI-7-3\(355--542\)/AFMI-7-3\(437--445\)-H-130502R2.pdf](http://www.afmi.or.kr/papers/2014/Vol-07_No-03/AFMI-7-3(355--542)/AFMI-7-3(437--445)-H-130502R2.pdf)

⁹¹<https://cliplab.org/papers/fuzzy-lpar02.bitmap.pdf>

- [101] Enrique Vidal, Andrés Marzal, and Pablo Aibar. Fast computation of normalized edit distances. *IEEE Transactions on Pattern Analysis and Machine Intelligence*, 17(9):899–902, Septembre 1995. [Available [online](#)⁹²].
- [102] Robert A. Wagner and Michael J. Fischer. The string-to-string correction problem. *Journal of the ACM*, 21(1):168–173, January 1974. [Available [online](#)⁹³].
- [103] Kevin Wayne. Union-find. Tutorial lecture slides based on book “Algorithm Design” by Jon Kleinberg and Éva Tardos (Addison-Wesley, 2015). [Available [online](#)⁹⁴].
- [104] Raymond T. Yeh. Toward an algebraic theory of fuzzy relational systems. Technical Report TR-25, Department of Computer Sciences and Electronics Research Center, the University of Texas at Austin, Austin, TX (USA), July 1973. [Available [online](#)⁹⁵].
- [105] John Yen. Generalizing term subsumption languages to fuzzy logic. In John Mylopoulos and Raymond Reiter, editors, *Proceedings of the 12th International Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence*, pages 472–477, Sydney, Australia, August 24–30, 1991. IJCAI, Morgan Kaufmann. [Available [online](#)⁹⁶].
- [106] Lotfi A. Zadeh. Fuzzy sets. *Information and Control*, 8:338–353, 1965. [Available [online](#)⁹⁷].
- [107] Lotfi A. Zadeh. Similarity relations and fuzzy orderings. *Information Sciences*, 3:177–200, 1971. [Available [online](#)⁹⁸].
- [108] Lotfi A. Zadeh. A fuzzy-set-theoretic interpretation of linguistic hedges. *Journal of Cybernetics*, 2(3):4–34, 1972. [Available [online](#)⁹⁹].
- [109] Lotfi A. Zadeh. Outline of a new approach to the analysis of complex systems and decision processes. *IEEE Transactions on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics*, 3(1):28–44, January 1973. [Available [online](#)¹⁰⁰].
- [110] Hans-Jürgen Zimmermann. *Fuzzy Set Theory—and Its Applications*. Springer Science+Business Media, New York, NY (USA), fourth edition, 2001. [Available [online](#)¹⁰¹].

⁹²<https://pdfs.semanticscholar.org/al70/6eef7de2c253022c45d87572a59aca41f625.pdf>

⁹³<http://www.inrg.csie.ntu.edu.tw/algorithm2014/homework/Wagner-74.pdf>

⁹⁴<https://www.cs.princeton.edu/wayne/kleinberg-tardos/pdf/UnionFind.pdf>

⁹⁵<ftp://www.cs.utexas.edu/pub/techreports/tr73-25.pdf>

⁹⁶<https://www.ijcai.org/Proceedings/91-1/Papers/073.pdf>

⁹⁷<https://people.eecs.berkeley.edu/zadeh/papers/Fuzzy%20Sets-Information%20and%20Control-1965.pdf>

⁹⁸<https://people.eecs.berkeley.edu/zadeh/papers/Similarity%20Relations%20and%20Fuzzy%20Orderings-Information>

⁹⁹<https://people.eecs.berkeley.edu/zadeh/papers/A%20fuzzy-set-theoretic%20interpretation%20of%20linguistic>

¹⁰⁰<http://ieeexplore.ieee.org/document/5408575/>

¹⁰¹[http://kashanu.ac.ir/Files/Content/H.-J.%20Zimmermann%20%20\(auth.\)%20Fuzzy%20Set%20Theory%E2%80%94and%20It](http://kashanu.ac.ir/Files/Content/H.-J.%20Zimmermann%20%20(auth.)%20Fuzzy%20Set%20Theory%E2%80%94and%20It)